

Night-Time Economy Scrutiny Review – Draft Final Report

Summary

1. This report presents the findings from the corporate scrutiny review of York's Night Time Economy (NTE), incorporating the findings from the individual scrutiny reviews carried out by the four standing overview & scrutiny committees.
2. This report also takes account of:
 - The findings from a 'Yorkafter5' survey carried out in support of the review (see paragraph 10 below & Appendix 1)
 - The proposals for a new city marketing organisation -NewCo (see paragraph 17 below and Appendix 2)
 - The ongoing work of Safer York Partnership through their multi-agency task group AVANTE (see paragraph 18 below and Appendix 3)
 - Additional evidence provided by CYC Policy & Performance (see paragraphs 19 - 23 below)

Introduction

3. The evening economy is one of the most important elements of York's local economy. Bars, restaurants and clubs together provide 6.9% of city-centre employment, and contribute almost a quarter of a billion pounds to the city's economy - £220 million in direct spend, which with the multiplier effect amounts to £300 million per annum (the multiplier effect being the additional increase in spending indirectly associated with an initial spend, for example the amount spent on wages for staff leads to those staff spending wages in the city's economy).
4. The table below shows the importance of York's late night economy compared with other places. York has the second-highest reliance on the

evening economy for employment in the UK, second only to Bournemouth, and well ahead of cities such as Edinburgh, Sheffield and Manchester.

Area	Total in Employment in "Evening Economy" sectors (2012)	Proportion of total in Employment in "Evening Economy" sectors (2012)	Percentage point change since 2009
Bournemouth	6900	8.9%	-0.3%
York	6700	6.5%	0.6%
Brighton and Hove	8000	6.3%	0.9%
Bath and North East Somerset	5000	5.8%	0.4%
Edinburgh, City of	18100	5.6%	0.1%
Cheshire West and Chester	8300	5.5%	0.8%
Liverpool	10600	4.6%	0.3%
Norwich	3900	4.5%	0.3%
Plymouth	4800	4.4%	0.0%
Glasgow City	16600	4.3%	0.2%
Oxford	4500	4.3%	1.0%
Cambridge	3700	4.1%	0.6%
Aberdeen City	7200	4.0%	0.4%
Bristol, City of	9200	3.9%	0.4%
Birmingham	15300	3.2%	0.2%
Leeds	12700	3.1%	-0.1%
Nottingham	6000	3.0%	-0.2%
Sheffield	7300	3.0%	-0.1%

Source: Business Register and Employment Survey 2012

- The percentage of employment in the evening sector is increasing, whereas in some other cities (e.g. Leeds) the level is decreasing. York has long been a popular destination for day-time visitors, but there is an increasing focus on converting day visitors into overnight stays, given the difference in comparative spend.
- According to recent statistics from Visit York, annual visitor spending is up by £163 million from £443 million to £606 million. Visitor numbers have remained constant at 7 million – an estimated 6 million leisure visits and 1 million business visits. Overnight visitors account for the lion's share of the value of tourism, contributing £399m compared to £207m from day visitors (66% v 34%).

7. The previous strategy for the Night Time Economy was written in 2007, with a particular focus on tourism. This strategy is now due for revision, and in light of Visit York's work on increasing the visitor economy, the emphasis of this revision has been on capturing the views of residents.

Background to Review

8. At a meeting on 24 June 2013, this committee considered a number of possible topics for review in this municipal year, including two topics which cut across the remits of all the scrutiny committees (Improving York's Night time Economy, and Impacts of Mental Health). It was recognised that both topics would support the Council's current key priorities in its Council Plan 2011-2015.
9. In July 2013, this Committee received a briefing report on the suggested night time economy theme and having acknowledged its suitability for corporate scrutiny review, instructed each of the Overview and Scrutiny Committees to carry out a NTE related review in line with their individual terms of reference.

Consultation

10. To support the corporate review an online survey "Yorkafter5" was undertaken, running from 14 October 2013 to 29 November 2013. The survey included questions in support of all the reviews, except the health review and the response was good (472 responses). A report on the findings from the Yorkafter5 Survey is shown at Appendix 1.
11. Subsequently, in order to further explore some of those survey findings, the Policy, Performance & Innovation Team held a number of focus group meetings, gathered the views of City of York Council staff, and discussions were held with members of the licensed retail trade – the findings supported the views of the public identified through the online survey, and were reported to Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee at its meeting on 7 April 2014.

Information Gathered

12. The standing Overview and Scrutiny Committees agreed to investigate the following topics – links have been provided at the end of this report to each of their final reports:
 - Economic & City Development – to encourage longer retail opening hours and enhance evening access in and out of the city centre

- Health – to identify the impact of the night-time economy on the Emergency Department at York Hospital at peak times
- Community Safety – to examine ways to improve the attractiveness and cleanliness of the city centre in the evening
- Learning & Culture – to identify an improved cultural offer up to 8pm in order to extend the tourist day and encourage more tourists to stay for longer or overnight, with a particular emphasis on families

Conclusions Arising From Scrutiny Reviews

13 Economic & City Development

- Whilst evidence showed that residents have an appetite for extending retail opening hours in the city centre, retailers were wary as this was not borne out in support for late-night opening in the run up to Christmas 2013.
- A coordinated approach to changes in retail opening hours would be needed with retailers working closely with CYC and transport operators.
- Any change will need to be properly promoted so residents know when shops will be open and when buses will be running
- As in other cities, special events in the city centre were a catalyst for attracting people into the centre and that should be encouraged.
- The reliability of public transport services was key and those providers were doing everything they could to review their operations to match the demand.
- There appears to be an encouraging level of cooperation between retailers and transport operators and a willingness to work together to promote measures that will benefit the city centre.

14. Learning & Culture

- A partnership approach will be required between cultural and entertainment providers, retailers and transport providers to achieve improvements in the city centre early evening economy, as no one organisation can achieve it alone.
- Increasing the number of events and activities would over time encourage more visitors to come and more residents to participate.

- Better collaboration between existing providers of all sizes is required to increase the number of events being run in tandem, to help generate the critical mass needed and the footfall that retailers and transport providers are looking for to extend their services
- There is a lack of awareness of what is already on offer. Therefore better promotion/marketing is needed e.g.:
 - There is a need in York for more free marketing opportunities and a single, comprehensive listings service or publication
 - the city centre lacks a focal point where residents and visitors can find information on what's on each day
- Some of the heritage and larger cultural venues in York may be suitable for alternative cultural use after their close of normal business which would be one way of helping to bridge the gap between 5-8pm
- a new concept is required, to be run over a number of weeks rather than on consecutive nights in order to create a precedent for visitors and locals to stay in the city centre in the early evening

15. Community Safety

- The negative impact on the cleanliness and attractiveness of the city centre created by both the presentation of city centre businesses commercial waste and the inappropriate distribution of flyers etc needs addressing as a matter of urgency if the Council is to improve the aesthetics of the city centre and help reduce opportunities for anti-social behaviour.

16. Health

- While the Committee recognised the adverse effects of alcohol consumption on the work of health partners and the patients they are caring for, it was not possible to identify where the alcohol was being consumed although there was some anecdotal evidence from Street Angels of people preloading before coming into the city centre.
- The huge influx of people frequenting licensed premises in the city centre at the weekend was having a significant bearing on the hospital attendance figures – particularly alcohol related attendances.
- The high number of alcohol related attendances at night was putting an unnecessary strain on hospital staff, their time, beds and cubicles, and waiting times at the Emergency Department and on the Ambulance Service.

- The cost of running a local alcohol awareness campaign could not be justified given the number of wide-reaching national campaigns
- The ongoing problem of broken glass in the city centre as a result of anti-social behaviour needed to be addressed.
- The value of the good working relationships between the key organisations including Police, ambulance staff, Street Angels and door staff, working in the city centre was acknowledged.

Additional Information Gathered

17. To support the Committee's consideration of the recommendations arising from all of the reviews, information was provided regarding the proposals for a new city marketing organisation (NewCo) being developed to build on the way York is promoted as a visitor destination and business location. A report setting out the specific productivity challenges the city faces went to Cabinet in November 2013, recommending the development of a number of new approaches to attracting investment. One of which was a new approach to delivering marketing, culture, tourism and business development for the city. The Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee considered the detailed aim and outcomes for this new approach at its meeting in March 2014 - see Appendix 2.
18. In addition, as none of the reviews focussed specifically on anti-social behaviour in the city centre and its effect on the night time economy, Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee received a detailed report on the work of Safer York Partnership through their multi-agency task group AVANTE - see Appendix 3.
19. Finally, in early April 2014 the Committee received a supporting report from CYC's Policy, Performance & Innovation Team detailing the work already underway/planned in York to help address some of the issues identified by the scrutiny reviews.
20. For example, in regard to retail opening hours and transport, the Committee were informed of:
 - Development work in the Micklegate Quarter, including a memberships scheme, retailer discount, work on attracting new businesses, including new cafe
 - A review of the council's Markets strategy to increase offer/ positioning/ footfall, aligned with investment through Invigorate York

- A commercial study commissioned to look at overnight accommodation needs for the visitor economy
- Trustees Saving Bank award application for digital innovation in the high street
- Fashion City York – events scheduled for May 2014
- A review of car parking fees and a trial of a pay-on-exit barrier to be installed at a pilot site - the cost of doing so means that the effectiveness will need to be tested before further roll-out.
- Ongoing work with the Quality Bus Partnership, including activity to make bus fares more affordable via through-ticketing and weekly tickets
- An investigation of the use of different media for ticketing such as smart phones or smart cards
- Bus interchange works
- Bus network review
- itravel – increasing awareness of different modes of transport and their availability
- Reinvigorate York proposals to extend foot street hours to include Fossgate, to make walking an attractive option.

21. In regard to cultural opportunities in the early evening, the Committee learnt that:

- Visit York has adopted a new visitor strategy, which includes the promotion of York as a year-round city, using the many festivals in the city as part of the strategy.
- This year in particular there is a programme of events leading up to the Tour de France.
- The WoW partnership is looking to embed cultural strategy within economic plans.
- Reinvigorate York is improving outdoor spaces currently used as open-air performance spaces e.g. King's Square.
- The Guildhall is being developed as a centre for digital arts, and could form a suitable venue for early evening digital arts events

22. The report also provided information on lessons learnt from elsewhere and examples of good practice that may be transferable i.e.:

- Norwich's "Head Out Not Home" campaign, aimed at workers in the city
- Norwich has set up a "Norwich Evenings" Facebook page as the official source of information for evening entertainment, where other Facebook users can post details of their events

- Oxford's "Alive After Five" campaign included work with retailers to extend opening hours in the city centre, and an increase in evening bus services (including the Park and Ride to 11.30 pm on Fridays and Saturdays)
- Hull undertook a review of city centre street lighting, increasing lighting in certain areas to improve perceptions of safety
- Colchester has a non-profit volunteer initiative called "Slackspace" that uses empty premises as community art spaces, some of which are open in the early evening to capture the post-work visitor.

23. Finally, the Committee were informed that some local authorities have introduced Business Improvement Districts (BIDs); others have successfully achieved Purple Flag Status - a quality kitemark for evening safety which assesses a range of criteria including appeal, attractiveness, cleanliness, and culture. In the course of accreditation, cities need both private and public sectors to work together to promote a safe environment.

Concluding the Work on the Review

24. In March 2014, Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee set up a Task Group to consider all of the evidence gathered and the findings from the individual scrutiny reviews. The Task Group met twice during late March / early April with the intention of considering the recommendations arising from those reviews and looking at how best to package those recommendations, in light of the additional information provided.
25. The Task Group acknowledged that the evening economy in York was flourishing later into the night but recognised there is a disconnect between day and night. With this in mind they were pleased to note that many of the arising recommendations were aimed at addressing the dead period in the city centre between 5 – 8pm.
26. They accepted that based on the remit set for the corporate scrutiny review it had not been possible for the Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee to directly review issues affecting the city's night time economy. However, they recognised that many of the Health Committee's findings were related to alcohol and anti-social behaviour in and around the city centre which for many is seen as being a barrier to people visiting the city centre at night. The findings from Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee also addressed factors that increase opportunities for anti-social behaviour, which it felt could be dealt with through a co-ordinated approach by CYC services.

27. The remaining two Committees focussed on improving the city centre economy primarily between 5pm and 8pm and the Task Group agreed with the overall view that without a coordinated approach to extending retail opening hours, public transport availability and parking, and cultural opportunities, it would not be possible to achieve significant and sustainable long term improvements.
28. The Task Group also noted the partnership arrangements of the new marketing organisation, recognising that the Council would not have sole control in setting its specification.
29. With all of that in mind, the Task Group acknowledged the hard work of all the overview and scrutiny committees and agreed to make four key recommendations:
 - i. That CYC Economic Development Unit work with partners to introduce a pilot scheme in the Coppergate Shopping Centre area on Friday evenings, incorporating the following elements:
 - Extended retail opening hours until 8pm.
 - Extended opening hours for Cultural offer providers in and around the centre until 8pm
 - Opening hours for a number of Park & Ride sites be extended to 8:30pm during pilot period
 - The Council's city centre car parks to be free to residents from 5pm (instead of 6pm at present) during pilot period
 - Opening times of CYC secure city centre car parks be extended until 8.30pm during pilot period
 - A marketing and promotional package be developed in support of the pilot scheme
 - Buskers and street entertainers be encouraged to perform in open spaces in and around Coppergate Centre during the pilot period
 - Pop-up market stalls and food outlets to be encouraged to trade in the Coppergate Centre during pilot period
 - ii. That the Council, Safer York Partnership and health partners investigate the establishment of a city centre treatment and recovery centre to operate on Friday and Saturday nights to provide both clinical care and a place of safety

- iii. In an effort to improve the city centre aesthetics and help reduce opportunities for anti-social behaviour, CYC Officers in Public Realm, Waste Services and Legal Services work together with Safer York Partnership to identify an optimum way of preventing city centre businesses from presenting their commercial waste on the streets between 7pm - 6am.
 - iv. In regard to the new city marketing organisation currently being proposed for the city to promote inward and visitor investment - following its formation, NewCo to liaise with city centre businesses and relevant cultural providers to assess the success of the pilot - see Recommendation (i), and assuming a level of success:
 - a) Formulate a plan for a staged roll out across the city
 - b) Work with relevant city centre businesses and cultural providers to develop promotions and advertising that promote the early evening economy between 5-8pm.
30. To encourage a more joined up collaborative approach to cultural/retail provision in York in the future, the Task Group also agreed to recommend that:
- v. NewCo consider including within its specification:
 - A sub-strategy for helping to develop smaller festivals and supporting independent promoters to assist them in progressing new ideas, including providing and/or signposting possible funding for promotion/marketing.
 - Encouraging all heritage, cultural and creative providers to work collaboratively and share information.
 - Investigating the development or commissioning of a comprehensive listings service / publication.
 - Encouraging city centre businesses and attractions to clearly display their opening and closing times for each day of the week.
 - Promoting the use of the city centre's open spaces for a more diverse range of open air performances in the early evening period.
 - Encouraging Festival providers to extend the running times for Festivals and markets to cover the early evening lull up to 8pm,

and encourage Buskers and street entertainers to perform throughout that period.

vi. Cabinet to:

- a) Encourage relevant parties to support the revival of 'dry' discos for young teenagers, whilst recognising and addressing the reasons for their demise, in particular the issue of safety outside venues.
- b) Instruct the Sustainable Transport Operations Manager to invite Park & Ride operators to consider later closing times of two Park and Ride sites either side of the city, subject to the assessment of the pilot scheme
- c) Instruct officers in Public Realm to identify the best option for dealing with the use of flyers in York - either a flyer consent scheme or a No-flyer Zone
- d) Encourage York's heritage and cultural venues to offer up their spaces for use by York's other smaller independent entertainment providers (and by those based elsewhere in the country), outside of their normal opening hours,
- e) Introduce of a number of high quality managed poster boards, strategically and sensitively placed throughout the city centre, in line with planning and heritage guidance

Council Plan

31. The corporate review supports the following priorities identified by the Council in its Plan for 2011-15:

- Create jobs and grow the economy;
- Build strong communities;
- Get York Moving;
- Protect vulnerable people.

Implications

32. Specifically in regard to Recommendation (i):

- **Financial –**
 - Extending the opening hours for Park & Ride sites to 8:30pm during the pilot period - First York Ltd has provided approximate figures which would suggest an additional cost of £2.5k for an

extended service on a Friday evening only for the 12 week pilot period – First York can provide a more detailed breakdown if and when required.

Outside of this First York Ltd has already taken the decision to extend the running times of the Monks Cross Park & Ride site in line with the opening of the new Vanguard shopping centre on 13th April 2014:

- Extended Service will run Monday to Friday;
 - First bus from town to site - 6:30am;
 - Last bus from town to site - 9:05pm
 - Last bus from Monks Cross through Park & Ride site and back into town - 9:33pm.
 - Site will close once the last bus has left the site.
- Extending the opening times of CYC secure city centre car parks until 8.30pm during the pilot period could be achieved within current resources.
- Taking five random Fridays from last year and looking at the average impact on income by bringing forward the evening parking for residents to 5pm (instead of 6pm at present), the lost income for the parking account would be around £160 per day x 12 weeks – approximately £2k. If this were limited to just Piccadilly and Castle car parks, the lost income for the parking account would be around £60 per day for residents.

Legal – Implications information has been requested from a Legal Officer and will be tabled at the meeting.

HR & Other – There are no other known recommendations.

33. Should Recommendations (ii) & (iii) be approved, the financial and legal implications associated with the establishment of a city centre treatment and recovery centre and the introduction of alternative arrangements for commercial waste presentation will be fully investigated and reported on.
34. In Regard to Recommendation (vi – e) There will clearly be costs associated with the introduction of a number of poster boards which will need to be fully evaluated as part of the procurement process.
35. There are no other known implications associated with the recommendations arising from this review.

Risk Management

36. In regard to Recommendation (i) - There will be an element of risk to all those involved in the pilot as there is no guarantee it will attract the necessary additional footfall to make it viable. However full and proper promotion and marketing of the recommended pilot scheme, will help to mitigate that risk.
37. Any risks associated with the remaining Recommendations will be identified as part of the required investigative work.

Recommendations

38. After taking into consideration all of the information contained within this report, its annexes attached, and the individual review final reports (viewable on the Council's website), the Corporate & scrutiny Management Committee is recommended to:
- i. Note the contents of this report and all the supporting documentation provided in support of this review
 - ii. Agree any changes required to this report prior to its presentation to Cabinet in May 2014
 - iii. Agree the recommendations to be made to Cabinet in May 2014

Reason: To conclude the work on the Corporate Scrutiny Review in line with CYC Scrutiny procedures and protocols

Contact Details

Author:

Melanie Carr
Scrutiny Officer
Tel: 01904 552054

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Andrew Docherty
AD Governance & ICT

Report Approved



Date

3 April 2014

Wards Affected:

All



For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers:

Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee Final Report:

<http://modgov.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13391&path=13028,13029,13389>

Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee Final Report:

<http://modgov.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13393&path=13028,13029,13389>

Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee Final Report:

<http://modgov.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13392&path=13028,13029,13389>

Learning & Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee Final Report :

<http://modgov.york.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13390&path=13028,13029,13389>

Appendices:

Appendix 1 – ‘Yorkafter5’ Survey Report

Appendix 2 – Information on Proposals for New Marketing Company (NewCo)

Appendix 3 – Safer York Partnership’s Report on the work of AVANTE

Abbreviations:

AVANTE - Alcohol & Violence in the Night Time Economy

BID – Business Improvement District

CSMC - Corporate & Scrutiny Management Committee

CYC – City of York Council

NewCo – New Marketing Company

NTE – Night Time Economy

WoW – Without Walls